"Evaluation of the effectiveness of recruitment for hiring managers"

AUTHORS	Katarzyna Zięba-Olma (ID) https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9002-9461

NUMBER OF REFERENCES	NUMBER OF FIGURES	NUMBER OF TABLES
21	0	3

Katarzyna Zięba-Olma (Poland)

Evaluation of the effectiveness of recruitment for hiring managers

Abstract

The issues raised in the article are very relevant due to the growing costs of recruitment for hiring managers. The object of the article is also important due to need to improve the level of knowledge of recruiters, which unfortunately is still imperfect. As a result of the research, it was discovered that the majority (75%) of recruiters do not have sufficient knowledge about the industry in which they recruit a manager, don't take into consideration the individual needs of organizations seeking managers with special skills, for instance, in the field of innovation management – the use of modern technologies. The aim of the article is to assess the effectiveness of recruitment for hiring managers. The main attention is paid to methods and tools used by the recruiters, evaluation of recruiter performance, following the subjectivity of the recruiter during the candidate's assessment, incompatibility of the organization and the candidate in terms of remuneration, length of breaks between individual stages of recruitment and their impact on candidates. The methodology of the study includes analysis of relevant literature, desk research and the research method – anonymous survey.

Introduction

It is important nowadays to organize efficient evaluation processes in recruitment as the human capital now is the main force in most companies. Very often the recruiter is not able to clearly name the stages of the recruiting process, tasks and typical failures at each stage, the process of hiring personnel in the organization is ineffective, but they do not understand what stages of the process are the source of problems. Heads refuse from recruiters, because they have difficulties in documenting and valuating the effectiveness of the staff service. The multifaceted nature of the HR manager's profession obliges to possess many qualities and skills. But it is very complicated to find such recruiter who will not only hire staff, but also be a development manager, realizing how to apply the knowledge and skills of this or that person and how correctly improve them.

The article defines the following theoretical, methodical and utilitarian objectives: the concepts of effectiveness of recruitment have been defined; the actions taken by the recruiter have been identified to increase the effectiveness of recruitment, as well as the barriers that affect this efficiency; contemporary methods and tools for recruitment for managers are discussed; proposals have been developed to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of recruitment for managers.

The main research hypothesis of the paper proved that the basic barrier for evaluating the efficiency of recruitment managers is the lack of sufficient level of direction of recruiter knowledge. Another equally important barrier is the problem of using the same recruitment methods and tools by recruiters.

1. Literature review

Referring to the definition of Davenport and Prusak (1998), the knowledge of a recruiter should be a composition of targeted experience, values, useful information and a professional view, creating the basis for assessing and assimilating new experiences and information.

According to other authors, knowledge is generally the lore and skills used by individuals to solve problems. It covers both theoretical and practical elements, general principles and detailed instructions. The basis of knowledge is information and data, but in contrast, knowledge is their derivative, and in addition is always associated with a specific person. It is the work of individuals, representing their beliefs about cause and effect relationships Probst, Raub, Romhardt (2002). This also applies to the competence of recruiters.

Knowledge is also understanding of nature, organization, markets (Krogh, Roos, Kleine, 1998) and also other field (Owoc, 2004), so modern recruiters should get to know the nature of the organization in detail before they start recruiting employees for positions in a given organization.

The knowledge that the organization has in fact is accumulated in the minds of employed persons (for instance recruiters) and when they decide to leave this organization, competency and skills go away

© Katarzyna Zięba-Olma, 2017.
Katarzyna Zięba-Olma, Dr., University of Economics and Humanities, Bielsko-Biala, Poland.

with them (Sadler, 1997). Therefore, each organization should protect itself against losing this knowledge if recruiters leave the job.

The knowledge of recruiters more and more often determines survival in the market, which means that it is collected and protected by the organization as an element of organizational memory (Tuomi, 1999). Contemporary recruiters should have above all the ability to continuously develop knowledge due to the need to function in an environment with variable and diverse needs.

The knowledge of the recruiter can be divided into explicit knowledge and tacit knowledge according to Polanyi (1962), while it can be stated that the tacit knowledge of the recruiter is its greatest value.

Because knowledge is the primary capital of 21st century organizations (with intangible, knowledge-based resources as the primary resource), knowledge organizations should provide for this valuable capital (Mikuła, 2006). Such organizations also include organizations employing recruiters, the greatest of which are those who create new knowledge (added value). Undoubtedly, such employees can be called knowledge workers.

Knowledge organizations employing recruiters also ensure conditions for the transfer of knowledge between recruiters, but it is not expected that recruiters will reveal all the secrets of their work among themselves (Rokita, 2009).

Clarke (2001) stated that the recruiter's knowledge should also be: exceptional, unrivaled (for instance the ability to create an original method or recruitment tool), applicable (for instance the ability to create a method or recruitment tool possible to implement and apply), valuable (for instance the ability to create a method or recruitment tool, which is currently demanded by the market) and dynamic

(for instance the ability to create recruitment methods or tools consisting of new elements difficult to generate by other recruiters).

In addition, the recruiter should also use his knowledge skillfully. Having specialist knowledge is useless if the recruiter is not able to properly use it.

Effective use of the recruiter's knowledge is forced, among other things, by the need to function in a knowledge-based economy.

It can be stated that the knowledge of a recruiter is a valuable capital of an organization. However, it should be stated that the recruiter's knowledge is valuable only when it is properly used. The main condition for keeping knowledge by the value is the necessity of its continuous development, because obsolete knowledge has a negative value can cause damage to the organization employing the recruiter (for instance choosing the wrong employee).

At the current rate of growth of information resources in the world, there is a problem defining the definition of professionalism (Fazlagić, 2010). According to Sikorski (1995), professionalism means the ability to perform specific occupational activities. The professional in this sense is anyone who perform these activities is the basis of maintenance. A professional is a person who is also characterized by the ability to comprehensively use his knowledge in practice (Miś, 2008). On the other hand, Pilch (2000) states that this profession requires expert knowledge. According to Evans (2005), professionals combine a common language, often associated with solid education. Professionals are able to communicate with other experts. Kaye or Prandy think that compliance with the rules of the organization in the organization of the moral code causes them to be attributed to professionals. Table 1 shows the features of professional recruitment.

Table 1. Features of professional recruitment

Features of professional recruitment
Having a recruiter, in addition to professional knowledge based on practice, also theoretical knowledge, which has to be constantly modified.
Ability to maintain interaction (direct contact with the candidate).
Ability to cross borders, but also need to have some rules (ethical code of the recruiter).
Having a recruiter's network of contacts to verify the candidate.
Involvement in recruitment (work as passion).
Treating recruitment not only as a job but also as a service to the public (the right candidate chooses to contribute to the competitiveness of the economy).

Source: own.

2. Practical insights

Recruitment is a holistic process that involves hiring an employee and taking a vacant position. Recruiting includes a number of integrated activities to attract valuable and interesting candidates to the company (Baczyńska, 2002).

The effectiveness of the recruitment is dependent among others from: the relevance of the diagnosis of the organization's staffing needs, the creation of the right candidate profile and the effectiveness of reaching the right candidates.

The effectiveness of recruiting is generally described as the relation of the results obtained from the recruitment process to the effort that has been incurred in planning, organizing and conducting this recruitment. Efficiency of recruitment should be linked to the principle of rational management, that is to be done in such a way not to waste time and money. Recruitment effectiveness can also be considered as a process in which recruiters, by using available resources, produce the results of recruitment that maximize the satisfaction of the organizations they are recruiting for. Both in the literature of the subject and practice, the concept of effectiveness is mistakenly identified with the notion of efficiency. The cause of this problem is probably to search in the English word: effectiveness. Recruitment effectiveness can be defined as the level of accomplishment of the goals set and the extent to which an activity is achieving its objectives.

Effective recruitment for managers is often dependent on the amount of remuneration given to the recruiter. Whether the financial factor is the most important, whether or not the recruiter determines his assignment, or not the category of knowledge workers. Another important factor affecting the effectiveness of recruiting is the need for the recruiter to be useful both to the organization that recruits the candidates and the recruit themselves. The effectiveness of recruitment may also depend on the desire of the recruiter to achieve the planned recruitment target. Some recruiters aspire to complete independence while recruiting, which may also have an impact on the effectiveness of recruitment. Such a phenomenon is not negative, if candidates are objectively assessed. Recruitment effectiveness may also be influenced by the relationship between the recruiter and the organization that recruited the recruiting staff.

Efficiency of recruitment can be increased by introducing:

♦ flexible recruitment;
♦ application of various methods and tools of recruitment;
♦ constant professional development of recruiters.

Due to the need to operate in a turbulent environment, modern recruits are forced to do their work in different places and at different times. Therefore, the introduction of flexible working hours and / or various forms of work organization can increase the effectiveness of recruitment. The effectiveness of recruitment can also be influenced by factors such as access to information and recruiting by a highly reputable recruiter on the market. Recruiting in organizations that have a positive image on the market can also be an important factor influencing the effectiveness of recruitment, as it has a positive effect on the behavior of candidates during recruitment. Recruitment effectiveness also affects the ability of recruits to self-organize, self-motivate and self-control.

Undoubtedly, the effectiveness of recruitment is influenced by the conditions under which this recruitment takes place. These conditions should first and foremost ensure that the recruitment organization (the ability to use IT tools during recruitment, which accelerates recruitment and makes it more flexible).

Table 2 shows the actions taken by the recruiter to increase the effectiveness of recruitment.

Table 2. Summary of activities undertaken by the recruiter to increase the effectiveness of recruitment

Using different sources of information.
Continuous development of the professional knowledge of the recruiter through participation in various forms of raising qualifications.
Striving for independent / independent decisions (but not subjective).
Using IT tools during recruitment.
Application of different methods and tools of recruitment.
Taking in some situations the risks associated with choosing a candidate.
Create a good atmosphere during the recruitment process.

Source: own.

The above list of actions taken by the recruiter to increase the effectiveness of recruitment includes only selected types of activities, so it is not a closed directory.

Effective recruitment is often impossible due to the presence of various barriers.

Table 3 shows an example of these barriers.

Table 3. Barriers that affect the effectiveness of recruitment

Type of barrier	Feature of recruitment effectiveness
Limited recruitment resources	Often, organizations organize "cheap" recruiting, which can reduce the effectiveness of recruiting.
Unreasonable use of resources	Inefficient management of resources during recruitment may reduce its effectiveness.
Low salary of recruiter	The low pay of the recruiter may have a negative impact on the effectiveness of recruitment.
The recruiter does not develop	The lack of development by the recruiter (not updating his knowledge) may reduce the effectiveness of his recruitment.
Inadequate conditions for recruiting	Unsatisfaction by organizations with the right conditions to conduct recruitment may reduce its effectiveness.
Long time of recruiting	Some recruiters carry out recruitment activities too long, which may have a negative impact on the result of the recruitment process.
Lack of sufficient knowledge / experience / internal motivation by the recruiter	Many recruiters do not have sufficient knowledge / experience related to the industry, which operates an organization that orders recruiting workers. There are also recruiters who do not have motivation (internal) to work, which may affect the effectiveness of recruitment.
Possibility of risk	Sometimes selecting a candidate is associated with high risk, which affects the effectiveness of recruitment.
Different place and time of the recruit	The effectiveness of recruitment undoubtedly affects the ability of the recruiter to work in different places and at different times.
Autonomy of the recruiter's work	The pursuit of some recruits to complete independence while planning, organizing and conducting recruitment affects the effectiveness of recruitment (not necessarily negative).

Source: own.

Considering the different types of recruitment goals, you can also identify barriers to verifying the recruiter's knowledge necessary to perform effective and effective recruitment.

The above table indicates that barriers that affect the effectiveness of recruitment can be of various types. At the same time, it should be noted that the above barriers are not a closed set.

Porwit (2001) says that effective recruitment in modern times is characterized by the following characteristics:

- ♦ the use of information and communication technology by the recruiter, which contributes to the faster flow of knowledge;
- ♦ the importance of quiet knowledge remaining in the mind of the recruiter;
- ♦ structured recruiter value system (including ethical).

The effectiveness of the recruitment process depends to a great extent on the recruiter's knowledge. It is important to take care of this valuable capital properly using it. The basic prerequisite for preserving the value of this knowledge is the need to continually update it. Recruiting old-fashioned recruitment negatively affects efficiency of recruitment. This may lead to the choice of the wrong candidate.

2.1. Methods and tools for recruitment for managers. There is a breakdown of the recruitment due to their area:

1. Internal recruitment, which can also be divided into:

(A) indication of the appropriate candidate by the superiors on the basis of their experience, opinion of the employee, periodic assessments, achievements;

(B) organization of the internal recruitment process in the form of a competition based on clear rules communicated to potential candidates.

2. External recruitment – searching for employees outside the company, using different methods and tools (Tyborowska, 2005). External recruitment can be conducted directly by the employer, for example through a manager who manages the vacancy department or through a dedicated HR department. Another solution is to work with an external recruitment company.

The advantages of internal recruitment include among others lower costs compared to external recruitment or high predictability (candidates are known and already tested in the organization). Internal recruitment, however, also has disadvantages, such as the limitation of potential candidates, the lack of new perspectives by internal candidates or the possibility of conflict between employees. On the other hand, the advantages of external recruitment include the ability to reach a wide group of candidates or the opportunity to introduce new experiences and knowledge by candidates from outside the organization. The disadvantages of external recruitment include the high costs, long duration or the risk of mismatching the candidate to the organizational culture of the enterprise (Baczyńska, 2002).

Choosing the right candidate is almost always associated with risk, most of which the organization is aware of. However, this risk can be reduced by choosing the right recruitment methods and tools. Contemporary organizations use different methods and tools for recruiting managers.

Basic recruitment methods (including managers) include: press releases, Internet, radio and television, database, direct search.

Employers are often recruited by means of recruiting. This method is also used for recruitment for managers. The qualitative result (degree of application matching to candidate profile) is, however, relatively low.

Today's widely used recruitment tool (also for managers) is the Internet. Numerous websites allow you to place job advertisements that attract a large number of candidates every day.

Another recruitment tool, which is often used for recruiting managers, is the database. The use of databases as a recruitment tool, however, has disadvantages: limited number of candidates and reaching people who are very satisfied with their current situation (including financial) and therefore are not looking for work.

Another method – direct cheeses – is the most expensive of all the recruitment methods mentioned, since the costs are related to the direct reach of the candidates (head hunters involvement). It also applies when looking for middle or high-level managers.

2.2. Characteristics of own research: methods and results. Students from the Scientific Club "EU Project Specialist" carried out their own research, among the examined objects there were 200 companies (operating in various industries), which during their own research led recruitment for managers.

Initial research (stage I) was carried out by first-cycle students working within the Scientific Circle "EU Project Specialist". The research part (stage II) was conducted by second-degree students (working within the Scientific Circle "Specialist for EU Projects"), accepting the role of candidates for managers (Mystery Client). This phase also consisted of several parts, namely, first, job applicants filled out application forms available on the Internet and only after receiving information (by telephone, or post, or organized direct interviews).

As a result of own research, it was found that:

1. There are interpersonal barriers (including personality bias) of the recruiter in the recruitment process. There is an element of jealousy on the part of the recruiter (influencing the result of the recruitment) in connection with, for example, the proposed amount of remuneration for the candidate.

2. In many cases there has been a lack of ability of the recruiter to assess the manager's organizational predispositions, as well as sufficient knowledge of the recruiter in the field of expert verification / technical direction (especially technical) of managers.

3. In some cases, recruiters (mainly as a result of the organization's decision to recruit managers) artificially extended the recruitment stages to, for example, "breaking" the manager's candidate in terms of the salary rate proposed by him (the length of the candidate's waiting period causes stress, demotivation, disorientation).

The above has made it difficult to assess the effectiveness and efficiency of recruitment for managers using traditional methods.

Conclusion

Recruiting can be used as a tool for strategic growth of the company. This requires instruments for assessment the recruiter's work, the transparency of the recruitment process, the availability and use of various information technologies to find the most suitable candidate and to save time. More and more new tendencies appear in the process of recruiting. Companies are becoming more focused on diversity, interaction and commitment to achieving productivity growth and corporate culture.

Also, in addition to increasing the requirements for the qualification of a recruiter, it is possible to update the types of interviewing. There are new tools, such as: online evaluation of soft skills, random interviews in a non-standard environment, VR-assessment, which are used to achieve effective evaluation of candidates.

The basic requirements that a recruiter must meet can be presented in this way:

♦ be able to determine the optimal number of personnel in an enterprise;
♦ to have knowledge about effective modern recruitment sources;
♦ be able to develop criteria for evaluating candidates;
♦ to use modern technologies and methods in personnel selection.

Recruiting, with the above characteristics, allows to determine whether or not a recruit is a professional.

Contemporary organizations increasingly require recruiters to choose from candidates who add value to the organization to outperform the competition.

Although the changes are related in a better direction, there are still barriers to successful selection of candidates by individual recruiters.

Acknowledgments

References

1. Baczyńska, A. K. (2002). Recruiting (Not) Defective. *Personnel and Management, 11*(128).
2. Clarke, T. (2001). The Knowledge Economy. *Education and Training, 43*(4/5).
3. Davenport, T. H., Prusak, L. (1998). *Working Knowledge - How Organizations Manage What They Know*. Harvard Business School Press.
4. Drucker, P. F. (1999). *Post-capitalist society*. Warsaw: PWN Scientific Publisher.
5. Evans, C. (2005). *Knowledge Management*. Warsaw: Polish Economic Publishing House.
6. Fazlagić, J. A. (2010). The phenomenon of "excess of information" and modern education. *E-mentor, 4*(36).
7. Kaye, B. (1960). *The Development of Architectural Profession in Britain*. London: Allen and Unwin.
8. Krogh, G., Roos, J., Kleine, D. (1998). *Knowing in firms. Understanding, Managing and Measuring Knowledge*. London: SAGE Publications, New Delhi: Thousand Oaks.
9. Mikuła, B. (2006). *Knowledge-based organizations*. Cracow: Cracow University of Economics Publishers.
10. Miś, A. (2008). Characteristics of development processes of talented workers. In A. Pocztowski (Ed.), *Talent Management*. Cracow: Wolters Kluwer business.
11. Owoc, M. L. (2004). *Valuation of knowledge in intelligent management support systems*. Wroclaw: Publisher of the University of Economics Oskar Lange.
12. Pilch, P. (2000). Professional Who? *Master of Business Administration, 5*.
13. Polanyi, M. (1962). Tacit Knowing: Its Bearing on Some Problems of Philosophy. *Reviews of Modern Physics, 34*(4).
14. Porwit, K. (2001). The characteristics of a knowledge-based economy. Their contemporary meaning and conditions of effectiveness. In A. Kukliński (Ed.), *Knowledge-based economy as a challenge for Poland in the 21st century*. Warsaw: KBN.
15. Prandy, K. (1965). *Professional Employees (a Study of Scientists and Engineers)*. London: Faber.
16. Probst, G., Raub, S., Romhardt, K. (2002). *Knowledge management in an organization*. Cracow: Economic Printing House.
17. Rokita, J. (2009). *Dynamics of organization management*. Katowice: Publisher of the University of Economics in Katowice.
18. Sadler, P. (1997). *Management of postindustrial society*. Cracow: Professional Business School Publishing House.
19. Sikorski, Cz. (1995). *Professionalism. Philosophy of management of modern enterprise*. Warsaw: Polish Scientific Publishing House.
20. Tuomi, I. (1999). *Corporate Knowledge. Theory and Practice of Intelligent Organization*. Helsinki: Metaxis.
21. Tyborowska, J. (2005). *Recruitment of employees*. Warsaw: C.H. Beck